

added, in support of Knox's claim, that Hamilton was considered to have protestant leanings in France in 1541 and, indeed, suspicion of his sympathy for the new religious opinions was reiterated in 1546. Again, Panter's close kinsman was Norman Leslie, one of Beaton's main assassins, and Panter himself, who is said to have helped the "castilians", was considered contaminated with the new doctrines in 1546. As Professor Cameron judiciously observes, "that the Reformation came about with comparatively little dislocation was no doubt in part due to the extent to which humanist reforming ideas had impressed leading academics and clergy". Thereafter, "Calvinism played a decisive rôle in Scotland's educational programme". All in all, the humanists' rôle in religious life essentially lay in reforming the medieval church, in securing for the reformed church a firm basis in a revitalised educational programme and in providing the necessary biblical and theological scholars.

This highly successful volume significantly enriches our knowledge of Renaissance Scotland.

JAMES KIRK
University of Glasgow

James Kirk, *Patterns of Reform: Continuity and Change in the Reformation Kirk*.

T. & T. Clark, Edinburgh, 1989. Pp. xx + 516. £24.95.

Dr Kirk is a master of the art of the extended essay; he sets out to deal with a particular theme, amasses and weighs the evidence, presents and assesses the views of other scholars, and then draws his conclusions which are usually original, illuminating and convincing. Each chapter in this book is such an essay. There is the added value that together they provide a fresh panoramic view of the Church of Scotland in the half century after the Reformation in 1560.

The first essay shows how seeds of Protestantism were planted in Scotland in "Privy Kirks" and how these kirks "surfaced to assume the rôle of parish churches".

The second essay illustrates church life in Edinburgh, particularly through the life of one of its citizens, Clement Little, who was an advocate, a humanist, a Protestant, an elder in the Reformed Kirk, a philanthropist, an educationalist and a benefactor of the University Library.

The third essay deals with the percolation of Calvinist thought into Scotland and gives fascinating glimpses of those who brought and spread these ideas.

The fourth essay is a remarkable unravelling of the way in which the Reformed ministry was planted in the parishes. It shows how the great majority of this new ministry had been involved at some level in the ministry of the Church in its pre-Reformation days. They made great efforts to live up to the standard set by the General Assembly. Moreover, some of the old clergy who hesitated to become Reformed ministers gave part of their stipends to support Reformed ministers. Revenues of some abbeys were allocated to support Reformed ministers; Scone gave sufficient to support ten ministers, and Holyrood sufficient to support six. The priory at St Andrews had thirty-three appropriated parishes, but under the new regime twenty-seven of the priory's canons became Reformed ministers and staffed these parishes; by 1567, all thirty-three had ministers. Paisley Abbey had twenty-eight appropriated parishes; these soon had Reformed ministers. After only two years of the Reformation, there were 245 ministers in parishes. It was "an outstanding achievement" of the Reformed Church to have filled to soon about one quarter of the parishes of Scotland.

The fifth and ninth essays contain a fine analysis of the place of superintendents in the church. The Reformers held there was no higher office in the church than that of minister of the Word and sacraments. The influence of what the Reformers regarded as "the best Reformed churches" on the continent ensured that there was no desire in Scotland to maintain a continuity with the pre-Reformation diocesan system. Dr Kirk shows that from the first the Reformed Church regarded the appointment of superintendents as a pragmatic administrative expedient suitable for the time. There is, therefore, no sound basis for seeing in these officers a sign that the Reformers had no basic objection to an episcopal system or that they regarded them as embryo bishops. Only five were appointed and their areas of oversight did not correspond with diocesan areas nor did they cover the whole country. They did what any minister could have been commissioned to do. The General Assembly was ready to appoint other commissioners and visitors to carry out its orders; during the first fifteen years of the Reformation, twenty-six visitors were appointed to deal with matters in twenty areas.

Dr Kirk also deals trenchantly with two further arguments put forward in this area. First, there is the view that the three bishops who conformed and undertook to assist the work of reform thereby preserved the continuity and the diocesan framework of the pre-Reformation period. Dr Kirk affirms that there is no evidence that they were given the status of bishops or that they carried out distinctive episcopal functions such as ordination; they carried out the commissions given to them by the General Assembly and these could have been carried out by any minister assigned to do so by

the Assembly. This is well illustrated in chapter seven on John Carswell who was appointed superintendent of Argyll. Second, there is the view that Andrew Melville arrived in Scotland from Geneva in 1574 at a late stage of the Reform and implanted presbyterianism upon a church which had not hitherto shown a rooted objection to the episcopal system. Dr Kirk shows that this view was formulated early in the next century by John Spottiswoode who had exchanged his presbyterianism for episcopacy and had become an archbishop. He expressed his view in his *History of the Church of Scotland*. Dr Kirk notes that Melville did no more than elucidate what was already in the *First Book of Discipline* (1560) and which had been in practice for some years. Moreover, the veterans of the 1560 period concurred in the presbyterian programme set out in the *Second Book of Discipline* in 1578, and the two surviving compilers of the 1560 Book, John Row and John Winram, were among the compilers of the 1578 Book.

The sixth essay gives a clear account of the two-Kingdom view which prevailed in Scotland. The magistrate had a distinct place in the administration of law, justice and business. The church had an equally assured place as the enforcer of its own teaching, order and discipline, but the civil ruler, according to the *First Book of Discipline* had a duty to reform the church and defend its liberties. This led to tension between the church and the crown, each trying to bend the other to its wishes. The issues were often blurred because many magistrates were also elders. The tension often emerged in disputes over church lands and revenues. This issue is dealt with in the tenth chapter. The desire to possess the lands and revenues of the church was a motive which led to the crown, the nobles and the lairds, and the towns to cash in on the movement for reform. The crown appropriated large sections of the church's patrimony. The attempt to restore episcopal government in the 1570s was a device to divert even more of the church revenue into the pockets of the nobility. After this attempt failed, a compromise was reached whereby the rights of patronage were preserved subject to the right of the church to examine and approve those presented to parishes. The Assembly agreed to this "unto the time the laws be reformed according to the Word of God". This compromise had long repercussions, including even the great Disruption of 1843.

In the eighth and twelfth chapters Dr Kirk deals with the course of the Reform in the Highlands. He dismisses the view that a lethargic nationwide pre-Reformation church was replaced by a church with a dearth of ministers. He holds that the work of reform yielded a remarkable harvest of ministers in a very short time. In Moray, there were seventy-eight ministers and readers by 1574. In the area of the old diocese of Dunkeld with sixty-two parishes there

were twenty-four ministers and fifty-four readers by 1574, and in Dunblane thirty-three out of thirty-eight parishes had Reformed ministers. In the Highland areas as a whole there were 65 ministers and 158 readers covering 215 parishes. Moving further into the reign of James VI, Dr Kirk shows that few parishes in these areas were totally deserted by the Reformed Church; indeed, the settlement of ministers was "as tribute to the Kirk's commitment to the Highlands".

The extent of research into the primary and secondary material makes this an awe-inspiring volume. The cumulative impact of these essays reinforces Dr Kirk's place as a leading authority on this period. He has expressed with fine clarity what many students of the period have long desired to see in so impressive a form. Those writers whom he has criticised will have to take his verdicts into account; they will scarcely be able to reproduce their views without some measure of revision.

Dr Kirk states in a number of places that the Reformed Church was a "new Church" (pp. 326, 342, 386, 426). This is a debatable term. The Church is composed of people. It was the same people who continued to worship; they worshipped in the same old buildings; Dr Kirk himself shows that the great majority of the first ministers of the Reformed Church had already been serving in the pre-Reformation system. It was not a new church; it was a reformed church, and, as Dr Kirk also says, it had "a new regime" (p. 372).

This book is a fine work of scholarship and also a valuable contribution to the understanding of the place of the Church of Scotland in Scotland.

R. BUICK KNOX
University of Cambridge